## SALT LAKE CITY PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING Room 326 of the City & County Building 451 South State Street, Salt Lake City, Utah Wednesday, May 25, 2016

A roll is being kept of all who attended the Planning Commission Meeting. The meeting was called to order at <u>5:33:33 PM</u>. Audio recordings of the Planning Commission meetings are retained for an indefinite period of time.

Present for the Planning Commission meeting were: Chairperson Emily Drown, Vice Chairperson Andres Paredes; Commissioners Maurine Bachman, Jamie Bowen, Angela Dean, Michael Fife Michael Gallegos, Carolynn Hoskins, Matt Lyon and Clark Ruttinger. Commissioner Ivis Garcia was excused.

Planning Staff members present at the meeting were Cheri Coffey, Assistant Planning Director; Michaela Oktay, Planning Manager; Wayne Mills, Senior Planner; Lex Traughber, Senior Planner; Daniel Echeverria, Principal Planner; Amy Thompson, Principal Planner; Michelle Moeller, Administrative Secretary and Paul Nielson, Senior City Attorney.

## **Field Trip**

A field trip was held prior to the work session. Planning Commissioners present were: Maurine Bachman, Michael Fife, Andres Paredes, Carolynn Hoskins and Clark Ruttinger. Staff members in attendance were Michaela Oktay, Lex Traughber, Amy Thompson and Daniel Echeverria.

The following sites were visited:

- 877 S 200 West Staff gave an overview of the proposal.
- <u>477 L Street</u> Staff gave an overview of the proposal.

# APPROVAL OF THE MAY 11, 2016, MEETING MINUTES. <u>5:33:43 PM</u> MOTION <u>5:33:49 PM</u>

Commissioner Ruttinger moved to approve the May 11, 2016, meeting minutes. Commissioner Dean seconded the motion. Commissioners Drown, Paredes and Gallegos abstained from voting as they were not present at the subject meeting. The motion passed unanimously.

## REPORT OF THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR 5:34:14 PM

Chairperson Drown stated she had nothing to report.

Vice Chairperson Paredes stated he had nothing to report.

#### REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR 5:34:21 PM

Ms. Cheri Coffey, Assistant Planning Director reviewed the training session on June 11, from 9 am to noon. She asked the Commission to let her know if they would like to attend. Ms. Coffey reported the City Council had approved the Downtown Master Plan.

The Commission and Staff discussed the items on the City Council agenda and where they were in the review process.

Commissioner Ruttinger reviewed the open house for the VOA Youth Center.

The Commission and Mr. Paul Nielson reviewed the 9<sup>th</sup> and 9<sup>th</sup> appeal.

## <u>5:37:21 PM</u>

<u>Verizon Wireless Rooftop Antenna Conditional Use at approximately 2066 S.</u> <u>2100 East</u> - Tom Foster, representing Verizon Wireless, is requesting conditional use approval for the installation of a wireless antennae on the rooftop of an existing commercial structure with supporting equipment at the rear of the building located at the above listed address. This type of request must be processed as a conditional use. The property is zoned CB (Community Business) and is located within Council District 7 represented by Lisa Adams. Staff Contact: Lex Traughber at (801)535-6184 or <u>lex.traughber@slcgov.com</u>.) Case Number PLNPCM2016-00204

Mr. Lex Traughber, Senior Planner, reviewed the petition as presented in the Staff Report (located in the case file). He stated Staff was recommending the Planning Commission approve the petition as presented.

Mr. Tom Foster, Verizon Wireless, reviewed the proposal.

## PUBLIC HEARING 5:41:00 PM

Chairperson Drown opened the Public Hearing, seeing no one wished to speak; she closed the Public Hearing.

#### MOTION <u>5:41:47 PM</u>

Commissioner Ruttinger stated regarding, PLNPCM2016-00204 - Verizon Wireless Rooftop Antenna Conditional Use, based on the information and findings in the Staff Report, he moved that the Planning Commission approve the proposal subject to complying with all applicable regulations and conditions one through three listed in the Staff Report. Commissioner Gallegos seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

#### <u>5:42:38 PM</u>

<u>Central 9 Lofts Planned Development at approximately 877 S 200 West</u> - Soren Simonsen, representing the development group Central 9 Lofts LLC, is requesting Planned Development approval from the City to modify zoning standards related to alley accessed garages as part of their mixed-use development. The mixed-use development is comprised of 24 residences and eight ground floor commercial spaces and is approximately 3 stories in height. Currently the land is occupied by a community garden and an office/warehouse building. The land is zoned FB-UN2, Form Based Urban Neighborhood District 2.

## The subject property is within Council District 4, represented by Derek Kitchen. Staff contact: Daniel Echeverria at (801)535-7165 or daniel.echeverria@slcgov.com.) Case Number PLNSUB2016-00194

Mr. Daniel Echeverria, Principal Planner, reviewed the petition as presented in the Staff Report (located in the case file). He stated Staff was recommending the Planning Commission approve the petition as presented.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- The percentage of required materials on the structure.
- Recommendation number three as listed in the Staff Report.
- The side walk bulb out and if it was part of the proposal.

Mr. Derek Allen and Mr. Soren Simonsen thanked Staff for their work on the proposal. They reviewed the history of the project and the neighborhood. They reviewed the LEED certification, Trax access, art wall, parking and how the proposal would better the neighborhood.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant discussed the following:

- The parking for the proposal.
- If a HOA would be required.
- The square footage of the proposed units.

## PUBLIC HEARING 6:02:36 PM

Chairperson Drown opened the Public Hearing, seeing no one wished to speak; she closed the Public Hearing.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

• If a text amendment should be initiated for alley accessed garages.

#### MOTION <u>6:04:12 PM</u>

Commissioner Fife stated regarding, PLNPCM2016-00194 Central 9 Lofts Planned Development, based on the information listed in the Staff Report, the testimony and plans presented, he moved that the Planning Commission approve the Planned Development request with conditions one through four listed in the Staff Report. Commissioner Gallegos seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

#### <u>6:05:47 PM</u>

<u>Special Exception for an In Line Addition at Approximately 477 L Street</u> - Lisa Arnett, the architect representing the property owner, is requesting approval for an in line addition to an existing single family residence that is non-complying as to height and interior side yard setback regulations. This type of application must be reviewed as a Special Exception. The subject property is within Council District 3 represented by Stan Penfold. (Staff contact: Amy Thompson at

# (801)535-7281 or <u>amy.thompson@slcgov.com</u>.) Case Number PLNPCM2016-00136

Ms. Amy Thompson, Principal Planner, reviewed the petition as presented in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated Staff was recommending the Planning Commission approve the petition as presented.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- The grade of the site and the height request.
- The different heights of the proposed structure
- The square footage of the existing structure.

Ms. Stephanie Clark, and Mr. Jordan Clark, property owners introduced themselves.

Mr. Prescott Muir, architect, reviewed the proposal and why the Special Exceptions were being requested.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant discussed the following:

• The windows on the north side of the home.

## PUBLIC HEARING 6:17:42 PM

Chairperson Drown opened the Public Hearing.

The following individuals spoke to the petition: Mr. Dennis Piercey, Mr. David Trauscht, Ms. Adrienne McKelvey, Ms. Barbara Tarran, Ms. Diane Long, Mr. Jeffery Stevens, Mr. Josh Berg, Mr. Jeff Johnson, Mr. Phil Carroll and Ms. Gail Kass.

The following comments were made:

- The proposal did not fit the area and would have a huge impact on the neighborhood's view.
- The addition would affect the property values of neighboring homes.
- There are current noise issues and the addition would increase them.
- The proposed addition should fit with the current ordinance.
- The loss of neighboring views should be taken into consideration.
- The requested height was invasive and would be over powering to the neighboring property.
- Would take away the privacy and would give the feeling of being walled in.
- Proposal took from the neighbors and did not add to the area.
- Proposal did not fit the specifications for a Special Exception.
- The sign put in front of the property was removed by the home owner to try and keep people from attending the meeting.
- The house could be extended outward it did not need the extra height.
- Setting aside the height regulation would be contrary to the purpose of the law.

Chairperson Drown closed the Public Hearing.

The Commission, Staff and Applicants discussed the following:

- The length of the structure with the addition.
- The rear yard setbacks.
- The height of the pitched roof allowed in the ordinance.
- The other designs considered for the proposal.
- The options for the windows to allow neighbors privacy.
- How property values were considered under the ordinance.
- How much property values would be lost due to the proposal.
- Why the Special Exception was requested for the proposal.
- The dimension of the existing noncompliance structure and how the proposal would increase it.
- How Staff determined property values would or would not be affected.
- If the view was part of the character of the area or part of the value of a property.

## MOTION <u>6:58:48 PM</u>

Commissioner Lyon stated regarding, PLNPCM2016-00136, 477 N L Street In Line Addition, based on testimony and plans presented and the following findings, he moved that the Planning Commission deny the petition for Special Exception for an inline addition located at approximately 477 N L Street, based on public testimony, largely they have made a case for an argument that there was an adverse impact on the general well being, character of the neighborhood and potentially property values, the windows and massing and height and the neighboring properties.

Commissioner Dean asked if a recommendation could be made to modify the motion to allow the inline setback request

Commissioner Lyon stated yes.

## Commissioner Dean seconded the motion.

The Commission discussed the details of the motion.

#### Commissioner Lyon withdrew his motion.

#### MOTION <u>7:00:53 PM</u>

Commissioner Dean stated regarding, PLNPCM2016-00136, 477 N L Street In Line Addition, based on findings in the Staff Report, the Applicants presentation, Public Hearing and discussion of the Commission and reconsideration of standards B and C regarding impairment of property values and adverse impacts, she moved that the Planning Commission approve the portion of the application regarding reduction of the south side yard setback to seven foot two and five eights, however, deny the portion of the application requesting additional height for the flat roof. Commissioner Lyon seconded the motion. The Commissioners discussed the different portions of the proposal.

# The motion passed unanimously.

## <u>7:05:33 PM</u>

<u>East Bench Master Plan and Parley's Way Corridor Plan</u> - A City initiated petition to update the East Bench Master Plan and to develop a specific corridor plan for Parley's Way. The project area is bounded by South Temple and the University of Utah northern property lines to the north, University Street and 1300 East to the west, 1700 South to 2300 East to Parley's Way to the South, and the City boundary to the east. The plans will establish goals and policies related to the future growth and development of the East Bench Community. The project area is located in Council Districts 5 represented by Erin Mendenhall, 6 represented by Charlie Luke, and 7 represented by Lisa Adams. The draft plans can be reviewed at <u>www.slcgov.com/opencityhall</u>. (Staff contact: Wayne Mills at (801)535-7282 or <u>wayne.mills@slcgov.com</u>.) Case Number PLNPCM2014-00139

Mr. Wayne Mills, Senior Planner, reviewed the petition as presented in the Staff Report (located in the case file). He reviewed the options for approval or tabling the petition.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- If there were infill opportunities in the plan.
- If the East Bench Master Plan included the foothill area.
- The Wilshire Dr regional node and the possible land use aspects.
- Continuing the Public Hearing.

# PUBLIC HEARING 7:42:20 PM

Chairperson Drown opened the Public Hearing.

Ms. Ellen Riddick, East Bench Community Council, reviewed the groups included in the Master Plan proposal. She reviewed the process the proposal had taken and commended Staff on their work on the proposal.

The Commission and Ms. Riddick discussed if the plan was complete and the improvements that could be made to improve it.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- If the Public Hearing should remain open and if more time was needed to review the plan.
- If a tour of the area would be beneficial.

## MOTION

Commissioner Gallegos stated regarding, PLNPCM2014-00139, East Bench Master Plan, moved to table the plan to a future meeting to allow the Commission further review of the plan and keep the Public Hearing open. Commissioner Fife seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously. The meeting adjourned at 8:00:39 PM